

# CITTA

Volume 2, Winter 2023 - 2024

**A Sukrut India Publication  
to promote  
Psychoanalytic Reflections**

## **Note to Contributors**

### **A. Name:**

Citta, a Pali and Sanskrit word, is derived from the root word cit, meaning to perceive. For our purpose, we have used Citta to capture feelings that arise both from the unconscious and the conscious in the human psyche, leading to perceptions.

### **B. Purpose:**

Citta is a Sukrut India bi-annual response to the need to bring together various schools, practices and clinical experiences from across the world that have relevant applications in the context of India, thereby promoting psychoanalytic reflections in India.

Submissions demonstrating psychoanalytic reflections from actual experiences in personal and collective history will find priority. Intersubjective submissions that are a blend with history, geography, sociology, economics, politics and religion are also welcome.

Of special interest are submissions that reflect India's civilizational ethos, highlighting the tensions that surface between the lived reality in India, and primarily Western theory. Contributions that draw on personal experience of psychoanalysis and processes of identity development are welcome.

Citta hopes to foster dialogue among practitioner-scholars working with intersubjective perspectives and enhance the richness of the psychoanalytic process.

### **C. The Editorial Process:**

Editorial support is sought from practicing non-academic psychoanalysts.

### **D. Guidelines for Contributors:**

Citta and Sukrut India promise contributors that submissions will not be subject to the frustrations of technicalities imposed by screening agencies. However, Citta and Sukrut India will request data confidentiality and reserve the right to edit personal attacks.

After a submission is accepted, it will move towards legal and administrative formalities, and on to publication.

A manuscript must be presented in the following order: the title; an abstract (about 150 words); keywords (not more than 5); the main text (not more than 5000 words); a list of references; notes and appendices; tables with captions. Please include a word count. Submissions must be in Word format. Please do not submit a PDF. Figures should be saved separately from the text.

Please use English spelling style consistently throughout your manuscript.

Please use double quotation marks, except where “a quotation is ‘within’ a quotation”.

Make sure that all identifying information, including author names, and all citations that reveal the author’s identity, are included in the **List of References**.

All contributors should include their full name and affiliation after the List of References.

If there is a data set associated with the contribution, please provide information about where the data supporting the results or analyses presented in the manuscript can be found. Where applicable, this should include the hyperlink, DOI or other identifiers associated with the data sets.

Please obtain the necessary permission to reuse third-party material in your contribution. The use of short extracts of text and some other types of material is usually permitted for criticism and review without securing formal permission. To include any material which does not hold copyright, and which is not covered by this informal agreement, a written permission from the copyright owner will be necessary before submission.

We recommend that you keep a copy of your manuscript. Find out more about sharing your work. Citta and Sukrut India will assume ownership of a published contribution. However, on publication, you will be able to view and download your contribution online, enabling you to share your work with friends and colleagues. We are committed to promoting and increasing the visibility of your contribution.

Contributors are encouraged to share or make open the data supporting the results or analyses presented in the contribution where this does not violate the protection of human subjects or other valid privacy or security concerns.

Citta and Sukrut India have no submission fees, publication fees or page charges.

# Contents

1.	Note to Contributors	
2.	From The Editor	2
3.	Reflections from the Retreat, in Nov 2023	3
4.	Why Persecutory Violence? Psychoanalytic Perspectives from India	11
5.	A 1925 Cartoon	13
6.	Notes from an International Group Relations Conference	14
7.	Reflections, by Divvyia Bajpai	18
8.	Reflections, by Ruchika Gupta	25
9.	Intersubjective Reflections	33
10.	About the Contributors	42
11.	Upcoming Events	43



## Dear Reader,

We are happy to bring to you this edition.

Persecution is all around us, and it is becoming difficult to live like an ostrich. Persecutory violence continues to play out in the battlefields of Europe and Arabia, as we go to press. The fright and helplessness from larger society is reflected by Western psychoanalytic associations – in conference themes, such as IPAs Containing Diversity, Bridging Difference ... to PCCAs Democracy Under Fire: Citizens Fighting for their Values ... to the opening lines in the 27 Dec 23 letter from Officers of IPA: In these troubled times ... to Behind the scenes of toxic polarization: consequences of a divided world coming up early this year. Is the psychoanalytic community in India in sync with their Western counterparts?

The purpose of this reflective journal is to move away from knowledge for knowledge's sake and make a significant difference in India. Academics, after the painstaking academic journey to earn a doctorate, strive little to make a difference. St. Bernard of Clairvaux, a French abbot, wrote, "Some seek knowledge for the sake of knowledge – and that is curiosity. Some seek knowledge that they may be known to know – and that is vanity. Some seek knowledge that they may give to others their knowledge – and that is charity". So, how do what we have learned and discovered from Western psychoanalysis find its way into praxis, to address real-world tensions in India? How do we impact organizational and community leaders who are not academically inclined and could not care less for academic theories and jargon?

Consequently, Citta recognizes that the continuing persecutory violence in and by the West has little psychological impact in India today, except for stirring intellectual curiosities. Bewildered, we decided to dig into Our Persecuted Selves, the theme of this edition, and went away for a residential Retreat to explore what it means for us, individually and as a collective. A copy of the reflections is included here. Also included is a reflective report by three Associates of Sukrut who attended an online international conference.

We asked: Were Westerners submerged in repeated traumatic violence throughout history? We found some answers, and our hypothesis is included in this edition. We also added a 1925 cartoon!

We have two interesting papers, personal reflections on the theme of persecution.

We promote intersubjective study and seminars and found an interesting piece from Indian literature that makes us reflect.

Do submit material that you think would be of value. Citta is committed to submissions from practitioner-scholars in psychoanalysis.

Also, do write to us with your reflections and thoughts about this edition; we promise to publish them.

Editors (Anonymous)

Dec 23/Jan 24

## Reflections from the Retreat in Mysore, Nov 23

### The Theme.

We explored **Our Persecuted Selves** in the intricacies of our persecutory anxieties and paranoid delusions in personal history.

In the clinical setting, we often encounter survivors of inconsistent parenting, abuse, racism, etc. battling persecutory anxieties and paranoia – at times neurotically and other times psychotically. Holding on to a paranoid and delusional worldview is counter-productive to healthy living, but at least it is a world the individual prepares for.

### Reflections from Personal History.

1. Persecutory experiences were strong in childhood, and residues remain. Asking for food outside the familiarity and security of the home, and receiving a slap, evoked shame; the transference, this fear of being shamed again if asking for food in unfamiliar circumstances, exists even today. Waking up one morning, I saw a small boy playing with my toys. I was three years old, and I immediately grabbed my toys back. The boy was helpless and started crying. But I was happy to retrieve what was mine. My mother was watching this and gave me a thrashing, making me wonder why I received punishment for no fault of mine.

This helplessness and painful transference remained with me, and made me anguished as an adult if I see anyone helpless and pained to get what they need; my counter-transference makes me share whatever I have. I also have a fear of humiliation by my partner when he gets drunk. My persecutory counter-transferences are verbal insults, from being shamed and shaming him.

2. I embarked on a journey to confront the persecuted facets of my psyche. My persecuted self does, at times, cast shadows not just upon myself but also upon those in my intimate circle. I can trace the genesis of my persecuted self, after the pleasurable security and safety of my mother's womb. In early infancy, my anxiety about survival was strong. As a psychoanalytic psychotherapist, I know that survival anxiety is embedded in all humans from birth to infancy, see-sawing between the Kleinian good and the bad breast. I learned later in life that my mother did not want to conceive me, so I transferred to my father the unconscious responsibility to keep me alive. Elevated on this pedestal, I held him to unrealistic standards and transferred to him an unrealistic dehumanization. Accepting his vulnerabilities has been a formidable challenge for me, as I clung to my fantasized hero. I am now exploring these delusions, making space for authentic realities about him to emerge in my mind.

I am becoming increasingly conscious that my helplessness (a feeling) metamorphoses into anger (an emotion), which I then direct at my loved ones. From childhood and into adolescence, a belief that I held on to was that I must unquestioningly obey my mother, taking me down a path that led to conformity rather than exploration. However, despite her control, my early childhood memories are also of curiosity and exploration. These endeavors were often met with unpleasant transferences from my mother, and my feelings of helplessness sowed the seeds of fear of punishment. Reflecting on my personal history, I also remember various instances when my mother stopped me from exploring dangerous things. Looking back, much of the helplessness turning to anger towards her appears unrealistic today, because I now see the other side of my mother, a guardian ensuring my safety.

My persecutory anxiety from the collective becomes weaker as I begin to acknowledge the uniqueness of the other. Our ancient civilization has always been a harmonious coexistence of diverse cultures. The man-made constraint of resources during the long years of colonization created experiences of deprivation and denial, as did the inability to accept differentiation, thereby contributing to the formation of persecutory anxieties.

The retreat helped me unclog many chaotic thoughts. It made me calm, encouraging me to venture deeper into the uncharted realms of self-discovery.

3. I worked on my persecuted self, and discovered aspects that were unknown to me. I never gave my experience of abuse a name until I was 23, although the feeling of helplessness persisted. Owning up the pleasurable side of sex was challenging because I have been told that it is shameful for a female in our culture to own up to sexual pleasure. I realized that I had conditioned myself to look at it only as a painful, persecutory experience because that's what others told me. Conveniently remembering the pain, and forgetting the pleasure, is tempting because I could remain a victim of all persecutory experiences; this is the game I have been playing with myself. Differentiation and seeing the duality of experience is my learning. Instead of "letting go" of persecutory experiences, I have tried in vain to "forget" and "erase" them from memory. Letting go of relationships has been my greatest fear. This fear is painful and has kept me self-persecuted. I have learned to acknowledge the pleasure that I have experienced in these relationships, and my ability to accept that "yes, this person or this relationship has also given me joyful memories to embrace". Can I retain my autonomy and keep discovering the many facets of myself?

4. The retreat was a good opportunity to explore my Persecutory Identity as direct transferences from my mother. Her abandonment when I was an infant was a result of her physical inability to nurture and nourish me, combined with her painful, persecutory struggles trying to fit into the hostile joint family of in-laws. While the abandonment of mother in my infancy left me with feelings of persecution, it also provided greater autonomy

to manage by myself, with my own natural resources, and I learnt to take care of my needs without help from others. In later years, this embedded autonomy in my personality impacted my ability to have intimate relationships, especially with my spouse who experienced abandonment by me. I can also see my fears of persecution in the organizational context, and have become more open to acknowledging my limitations realistically, and seek help from others. Owning up my vulnerabilities and seek help has also helped me to build better intimacy with my spouse as well as with my team at work.

5. I recall the unpleasant situations at home. I was forced to wear silk sarees and gold ornaments for a family function to show off our status. I was told to always cover my breasts. If I disagreed or did not follow the rules, my dad used to yell at me, scold me very badly. Even today I remember my helplessness, and continue to persecute myself. My 76-year widowed father ill-treats me, and I collude with him because I feel sorry for him in his vulnerabilities. When I decided to marry a boy of my choice, go out with my friends and laugh loudly, talk to men – these choices were questioned because of my safety, but where was the concern for my safety when my uncles touched me inappropriately? I grew up angry and resentful. Making personal decisions became a difficult task for me. It is difficult for me to trust a man and to socialize with men.

Even though I am an educated, working woman, I do not have the rights of a daughter or wife. I have to earn for the family as well as do household chores, but cannot have financial freedom or allowed to take any decision. If I take a stand, I face verbal abuse or emotional blackmail from my father.

6. Holding on to shame and guilt makes me feel helpless, and leads to outbursts of anger on people in my life. Pleasurable experiences are attributed as shameful by the society where I live, and this leads me to self-persecuting and self-tormenting behaviors.

I am unable to let go of relationships or stop caring for people because I find myself colluding with unpleasant feelings that I have about them.

I tend to split the reality, between an idealized virtue and the persecutory side in a person. Consequently, I punish myself. Much of my self-persecution is based on my fantasies from the history of real persecutions experienced by me in childhood, both psychological and physical.

7. My explorations in childhood were punished. I faced these persecutory experiences helplessly, shaking my self-confidence as I grew up. Today, I continue to live with fear of punishment, and I am cautious and alert. I got in touch for the first time with strong residues of shame. I realized that my zero tolerance for dishonesty were transferences from my father and my parents' secrecy about their relationship. My counter-transference has predominantly been ensuring others to understand me fully, to trust me. I also deliberately

try to be invisible, in my fear that others will isolate me.

I also got in touch with my persecution of others, especially a husband who is human with his own “feet of clay”. I have started to realize the small acts of support extended by him.

Polarization seems to have a great impact today. Religious differences, different languages, and the north-south divide in India are some of the challenges that I face at my workplace. The fear emerging from collectives tends to make visibility less and makes people voiceless, I have experienced this. I think that I need not be apologetic of personal beliefs but keep myself open to dialogue and discourse, which anyway has been a strength in our ancient civilization.

8. My understanding of the persecution of the self or of the other is based on the challenges of race, class, and sexuality faced by a human being either as an individual or as a community. Looking at myself as the eighth in a family of ten siblings, I realized how difficult it would have been for my mother to pay attention to my needs. Moreover, I lost her at the age of three, so the persecution of myself and the pain of losing made me hold on to other caregivers for my survival. When they did not respond to my needs, I felt victimized. Coming from a mixed culture my mother was from an orthodox Mangalorean community and my father was from an Anglo-Indian Community where she was humiliated and discriminated against. I also inherited my mother's transference of her helplessness and mute anger from these experiences of persecution. Free association helped me to take a look at myself, and also relate to the residues of collective unconscious in me. The powerful persecute the voiceless or the powerless, which leads to the deprivation of human rights, dignity, and respect.

As a mother, I realize that by not being able to breastfeed my son beyond three months, I over-compensated by breastfeeding my daughter for almost 3 years. This guilt led me to self-persecution in many ways, which in turn makes me want to over-feed others.

9. For me, it meant connecting the dots from my childhood and realized that some residues are still there, leading to persecutory anxiety. I recollected a few childhood incidents with my parents and linked them to the irritation that I experience even now. This retreat was also an opportunity to explore the transfer from free association with my twins back home.

10. This retreat has provided me with valuable insights into the multifaceted nature of persecution experienced both internally and externally. It has allowed me to delve into the various layers of the human psyche, enabling me to recognize the residual impact of past life events. Understanding how these remnants contribute to self-persecution in our everyday lives was truly enlightening. I discovered that these patterns are prevalent among individuals who are in touch with their emotions and can process them.

One significant realization was the awareness of the persecution we inflict on others, often unknowingly from the unconscious. This newfound understanding allowed me to grasp the complexity of human interactions and the unintentional harm we may cause. Identifying the origins of this persecution, whether self-inflicted or projected onto others, was crucial in the process.

Furthermore, the retreat emphasized the importance of acceptance and avoiding collusion when confronted with challenging situations. Accepting various scenarios and refraining from becoming complicit in harmful behaviors are the initial steps toward resolving this intricate web of self-persecution. Once the source of the persecution is identified, overcoming it becomes a tangible goal, paving the way for personal growth and emotional healing.

11. Facilitating the group left little opportunity for self-reflection. Nonetheless, I was moved by some narratives and was in touch with my experiences of abandonment by my mother (for real logistic reasons), and my ability to fall back on my resources to stay alive. I worry about a “to-do” list in my head; this prevents me from stilling my mind in meditation, so there have to be psychoanalytic residues of the transferences of fear of loss in me.

### **Psychoanalytic Interpretations.**

It is evident from the narratives in the Retreat that a persecutory identity is the result of experiences in infancy and childhood, some from adolescent years.

Let us take a look at psychoanalytic reflections from India. Sudhir Kakar, conducting recent Seminars for a group of psychoanalytic psychotherapists associated with Sukrut, explained: *From breast-feeding, the Indian child proceeds not to spoon feed but to hand-feeding, less frequently to strollers than to being carried on the mother's side or back in skin contact, and extended co-sleeping with parents or elder relatives. In this atmosphere of early life, conveyed by visible skin contact over a long period, it would be reasonable to expect that the accounts of mental life in infancy would not exactly hew to the reigning psychoanalytic theories derived from Western experience.*

*In India, earthy aspects into which we are born – the terrain, the winds, the rains, the sunlight, the birds, the animals, the vegetables and fruits and flowers, the seasons – have a great influence on both our conscious and the unconscious, and naturally evolves into a unique idea of India that is sympathetic with the environment. The pleasure of eating is not only on the menu but is complete in the empathetic celebration of solidarity with others who share it”/* Consequently, Kakar asks in his book *Young Tagore – The Makings of a Genius: How would the cultivation of empathy, the defining idea of Indian civilization, work in practice? Modern psychology, Western in its orientation, has made great advances in uncovering the mysteries of*

*the human mind, the complexity of the human psyche. The truths it has arrived at (valuable as they are), are, however, partial truths. They largely look at a human being from two angles. The first is that the person is a body, a brain/mind entity in psychological terms, and thus they seek to understand the psyche through psychologies that derive from biology. The brain/mind school enjoys considerable vogue in modern psychology. The other focus of psychology is interpersonal, that is, the psyche is understood as a product of experiences beginning with the family with a person's social groups. ...What I would like to add – a dimension that I find largely missing from West-inspired psychology – is that a person is not only a part of his bodily and social orders but also of his cosmic order.*

In another book published in 2007, Kakar explains: *Sympathy, as I understand it, is the highest manifestation of the human soul. It is a continuum of loving connectedness... and for us ...a sense of sympathy as a hidden power in ourselves that is not self-centered and is a source of our highest self.*

Kakar explains: *All young people in families of India generally receive a good deal of attention and nurturance from the older generation, and maintenance of family integrity is valued higher than an unfolding of individual capabilities, a young Indian neither seeks a radical demarcation from the generation of his parents nor feels compelled to overthrow their authority to live life on one's terms. This is in stark contrast to The West where generational conflict is not only expected but considered necessary for the renewal of a society's institutions and is considered (mostly erroneously) to be a universally valid psychological truth. In Asia, the Middle East, Iran, Iraq, Turkey, and Afghanistan it is not the rupture but the stretching of traditional values that becomes a means for the young to realize their dreams. It is interesting that despite the fascination with movie and sports stars, and the omnipresence of these celebrities in advertising, the primary role models for a large majority of youth in these regions are from the family, most often a parent.*

In India, the family and community continue to play important roles in youth and early adulthood and, in the balance, bring about an experiential awareness about the duality of human experience, that there is suffering/pain and there is joy, there is fear and there is courage/hope.

India's relational ethos can be best understood by filtering Kakar from what he described in another 1985 paper:

*..... in the universe of teacher-healers, I had slotted my analyst into a place normally reserved for a personal guru. It seems that from the beginning of the analysis I had pre-consciously envisioned our relationship in terms of a guru-disciple bond, a much more intimate affair than the contractual doctor-patient relationship governing my analyst's professional orientation. In my cultural imagination, he was the personification of the wise old sage benevolently directing a sincere and hardworking disciple who had abdicated the responsibility for his welfare to the guru. My guru model also demanded that my analyst demonstrate his compassion, interest, warmth, and responsiveness much more openly than is usual or even*



*possible in the psychoanalytic model guiding his therapeutic interventions. A handshake with a "Guten Morgen, Herr Kakar" at the beginning of the session and a handshake with a "Auf Wiedersehen, Herr Kakar" at the end of the session, even if accompanied by the beginnings of a smile and a rare twinkle in the eye, were not even starvation rations for someone who had adopted the analyst as his guru. Not that I was uncomfortable with long silences during a session, only that the silence needed to be embedded in other forms of communication. In an earlier essay, I mentioned that the emphasis on speech and words in analytic communication is counter to the dominant Indian idiom in which words are only a small part of a vast store of signs and semiotics.*

All young people in Asian families generally receive a good deal of attention and nurturance from the older generation, and maintenance of family integrity is valued higher than the unfolding of individual capabilities. A young Asian neither seeks a radical demarcation from the generation of his parents nor feels compelled to overthrow their authority to live life on one's terms. This is in stark contrast to The West where generational conflict is not only expected but considered necessary for the renewal of a society's institutions and is considered (mostly erroneously) to be a universally valid psychological truth. In Asia, the Middle East, Iran, Iraq, Turkey, and Afghanistan it is not the rupture but the stretching of traditional values that becomes a means for the young to realize their dreams. It is interesting that despite the fascination with movie and sports stars, and the omnipresence of these celebrities in advertising, the primary role models for a large majority of youth in these regions are from the family, most often a parent. (Kakar, S. 2007. Penguin Books India, New Delhi)

Many years before Kakar, Bose, in his essay *On the Reliability of Psychoanalytic Findings*, cautioned against Western psychoanalysts who do not hesitate to dogmatize on their findings and regard them as 'settled facts' even when the analysis has been of a very cursory nature (Hartnack, Christiane. 2001. *Psychoanalysis in Colonial India*. Oxford University Press, New Delhi). But what remains valid is Freud's metaphor of depth, a central feature of his vision. Beneath the surface of the mind operate hidden psychodynamic forces; beneath the present lie the residues of the past, of both the individual and the species; beneath the manifest level of social interaction, instinctual forces push for expression. The former element in each of these pairs can be understood only reductively in terms of the latter. For Freud, this was what made psychoanalysis a 'depth' psychology.

### ***Hypothesis by the Group.***

The general theme that emerged from this Retreat is that our projective processes own aspects of the bad self in harmony with the good self, which then releases in our behaviors an empathetic understanding of the individual other and other collectives. A hypothesis by this group is that our persecutory anxiety is, therefore, individual and personal, and can be resolved by way of the "talking cure".



However, dominant transferences do exist in our collective unconscious. The material is from the stories of persecutory violence by European colonizers of this subcontinent. Transferences of the trauma from loss – in both the family as well as collective history – continue in families and communities in the North Western and Eastern regions of India.

*A British-manipulated partition of the subcontinent into India and Pakistan added to the sustenance of persecutory experiences, particularly in populations from the Northern and Eastern regions. Historiography unveils that from mid-August to mid-November 1947, about 10.2 million people migrated from, and to, West Pakistan. They comprised 4.4 million Hindus and Sikhs who went to India and 5.8 million Muslims who went to Pakistan. The violence and privations associated with this upheaval that followed the loss of ancestral property and cultural roots resulted in large numbers from all communities being killed or abducted, or dying. (Schechtman, Joseph. The Refugee in the World: Displacement and Integration. p. 108. AS Barnes, New York. 1963).*

An estimated 3.2 million Indians migrated from East Bengal to West Bengal in the east, abandoning ancestral land, homes, and livelihood. The persecuted from the Northern and Eastern regions of India carry psychological scars of the Komagata Maru incident (1914) in Canada, the infamous massacre of innocents at Jallianwala on 13 April 1919, and the 1943 Bengal Famine where three million people died, to name just a few. Indians from other parts of India were forcefully uprooted from ancestral homes and shipped as cheap labor in plantations owned by Europeans. Stories of brutal conversion processes to Christianity by the Portuguese in Goa have also started to emerge from the archives.

Working with material from the personal unconscious, a personal experience may illustrate the residues of paranoid delusion. I was traveling on the auspicious evening of Deewali being celebrated across the country. On boarding the airplane, I snapped at a young man for occupying my pre-booked seat. He moved immediately but replied that I could have asked for my seat politely and that I was visibly rude.

I had regained my composure by the time we began cruising. What struck me was the serendipity on the face of the young man. He had said to me what he thought was necessary. I, of course, apologized to him but was surprised at my sudden outburst, revealing the residues of persecutory anxiety in my unconscious. The helplessness of loss was transference from the collective unconscious, from my family and community history; it seemed I had lost forever what was rightfully mine.

Sukrut's invitation to psychoanalytical psychotherapists is to explore small incidents such as these and unpeel the unconscious material lying in our persecuted selves. At the same time, we acknowledge there is little we can do as Indians except extend compassion for the trauma of families losing loved ones in mindless persecutory violence that continues in Europe and Arabia.

**Compiled by the Retreat Group.**

## **WHY PERSECUTORY VIOLENCE?**

### ***Psychoanalytic Perspectives from India***

Persecutory violence dominates the Western civilizational idiom, unlike in India and elsewhere in the Global South and Africa where the struggle is to resolve demons in the personal unconscious.

After the end of World War II, countries descended from ancient non-white civilizations and great cultural traditions – China, India, Japan, Indonesia, Vietnam, Iraq, and Iran – were systematically converted into killing fields to satisfy European, British, and US greed and ambition. Resource-rich Asia and Africa and its non-white people have been silent, vulnerable targets for the WMDs that the white savage continues to assemble and sell. Asia, a continental cradle of civilizations covers a third of the earth's land mass and has two-thirds of the world's population.

European history and the history of the white race is the manifestation of a persistent behavior eschewing violence and persecution of the non-white, the other. By reductively visiting the underbelly of the history of Europe, from the 15th. century till WW II, we know that the ancestral roots of persecutory identity lie in the human condition in Europe for 600 years, societies ravaged not only by wars but by the devastations of climate, sickness, and poverty. This was the lived experience of the European white race for twenty generations. It is, therefore, little wonder for us in the Global South that the force of psychoanalytic residues of violence and persecution are still active in the white race even to this day.

We know from the depressing economic and social conditions of the poor in Europe in the 1700s and 1800s that the infant fantasy of life-threatening horror was not fully resolved in real life. Caregivers coping with deprivation and denial had little time to nurture infants, after managing the hardship and illness that was their destiny as a peasant and factory labor. Accepting an appointment in a distant colony at the age of 18 – 20 meant escape from misery, the brutality unleashed by nobles and aristocrats, along with the opportunity to make money. The cruel aggressor of infancy is replaced by a cruel aggressor outside, and the fear of persecution remains in denial, in the unconscious. The infant's rage, anger, and hostility lying below the surface found compensatory relief in the rich colonies through expressions of savagery on vulnerable, native populations, and in the unhindered loot for accumulation of personal wealth.

Another typical feature of schizoid object relations is the narcissistic nature of the collective West, derived from infantile introjected and projective processes. The relation to another person based on projecting bad parts of the self into them is narcissistic and is indicative of strong obsessional features. The impulse to control other people is an essential element in obsessional neurosis. The need to control others can be a deflected drive to control parts of the self. When these parts have been projected excessively into the other, they can only be controlled by bringing the other person under control.

This obsessive neurosis, by its very nature, also arouses guilt for the bad parts of the self, projected onto the vulnerable other, also leads to drives of repair and restoration of the self.

Many Indians have personal, fond relationships with individuals from the white race. Fortunately for the human race, there is reparation in the individual conscious engaged in melancholic guilt-laced private discourse. However, Fakhry Davids alerts us that personal shame and guilt expressed privately, will ensure defensive repetition, thereby perpetuating racist mind-sets and acts and taking one further and further from the possibility of reparation. Interpersonal associations tend to move slowly.

Human nature encompasses saints and sinners, and each of us holds all of these capacities. The question psychoanalysts need to ask is how much longer will the shame and guilt from human inhumanity lie in denial? Kleinian reparative processes, triggered by material lying below the surface, will throw up an occasional Arbuthnot, a Pilger, a Bill Gates, a Chomsky as well as delusional white race associations with the Dalai Lama.

**Annotated from *Want To Know What Lies Below-the-Surface! Really? A presentation by Manab Bose at the NIODAs 5th. Symposium 2021, on the theme NOT KNOWING AND COMING TO KNOW - METHODS OF INQUIRY INTO UNCONSCIOUS (HIDDEN) DYNAMICS.***

Gandhi shared an interesting insight in a speech on 03 November 1917: *There are two methods of attaining one's goal: Satyagraha and Duragraha. In our scriptures, they have been described, respectively, as divine and devilish modes of action. He went on to give an example of duragraha: the terrible War going on in Europe.*

Also,

*The man who follows the path of Duragraha becomes impatient and wants to kill the so-called enemy. There can be but one result of this. Hatred increases.*

**from The Collected Works of Mahatma Gandhi 16, 126-8.**



## One day they'll wake up

Almost 100 years ago, famous U.S. cartoonist Bob Minor had a realization: Western nations ruled the world because they were rich in money and guns.

China, India, and Africa were poor in money and guns, but rich in people. One day, the balance of power would shift.

Minor drew this cartoon in 1925. Now, 98 years later, the people of the world are waking up and realizing something has changed.

**Democracy Under Fire**  
***Citizens Fighting for Their Values***

**Notes from an International Group Relations Conference**

**A. The Experiences.**

1. The international experience made me feel very safe in my surroundings in India, as I heard many others from various countries sharing their experiences about violent wars. I realized that many of my fears were imagined, and that they came from within me. I confidently brought my thoughts and feelings to the group, although they were very different. The roles that I played in the conference was oscillating between helplessness and hope. The societal event helped me understand that democracy is also a fantasy which helps find creative ways of resolving a concern. Democracy needs hard work from the self, to find a voice and to be able to see things with compassion and love. I was able to voice these with ease.

2. My experiences in the GRC helped me get in touch with my culture and its impact on me. The constant discussions about the war helped me understand how survival can be fearful. The sense of belongingness, voicing feelings, care, and co-existence were a few themes that persisted within me throughout the conference. I felt embarrassed when an English person said that he was unable to receive themes from me, an Indian. During the Societal events, there was anxiety about the lost identity of some groups. This helped me understand the importance of taking initiative. When I exercised my authority to check about the lost group, it was easier for the others to follow. My biggest learning was that democracy did have multiple realities, various structures and dynamics, extreme fears from uncertainty, lack of safety, and abandonment. Nevertheless, there was also space for acceptance, reassurance, flexibility, negotiations, and taking up initiatives.

3. My experience in the International GRC has helped me get in touch with my roots, own my smallness and inadequacy in the big, wide world. I have always associated my cultural and linguistic identity with being weaker than that of others. I also entered the GRC in the same state of mind. I could own my smallness and inadequacy in the group, and that also helped others in my group to look at their anxieties. The constant sharing of war experiences evoked a feeling of my irrelevance in the group, as I don't have any personal experiences of war and violence. I could share this in the group, and others also owned this up; we discussed how very often we get stuck in the dilemma of not sharing joy because of the fear of being misunderstood. In the Societal event, we realized how we had forgotten to take care of each other's well-being, and when care was offered, a participant rejected it. I was concerned that a member of my group did not need care from us, but it also helped me accept the need of others to stay with their anger. Slowly, by the end of the GRC, all the interactions have helped me accept the dichotomies in the various societies and in people.

Democracy is multi-faceted. It doesn't come with one definition and just one experience. This conference has helped me to take a look at the diverse range of experiences in my country, and accept people with the baggage they bring.

## **B. The Reflections.**

1. The psycho-social world outside India is steeped in war and violence, both at the individual and collective levels. Persecutory anxieties dominate decisions. Even this GRC carries the title "Democracy Under Fire – Citizens Fighting for their Values", and there are many more. "Behind the scenes of toxic polarization: consequences of a divided world" is one coming up early in 2024. The line between healthy skepticism and paranoid suspicion appears blurred.

2. Witness the endless tensions in the West: Brexit, the Russia-Ukraine conflict, and the ongoing Israeli counter-transference in the persecution of innocent Palestinians. Notice the distorted (pained? tortured?) expression on the faces of white sportsmen and the crowds, in cricket and soccer matches, after a wicket is taken and a goal is scored. Can this be seen on the faces of players from the Far East and Africa hired to play for clubs in the West? See the two newspaper clips from soccer.

3. The powerful West seems to live in the delusion that it is at the receiving end of a malevolent other. Kipling's white man's burden appears to have been turned on its head!

Was the West submerged in repeated traumatic violence, we asked? Drawing from the works of Freud, Klein, and Jung, we know when individuals or groups feel threatened or have been subjected to extreme trauma, defenses against shame and humiliation emerge in behavior.

**Experiences and psychoanalytic reflections by Associates of Sukrut, nominated to attend this PCCA Online Experiential Conference in the Tavistock Group Relations Tradition, from 20 to 22 October 2023.**



20

# SLENDER EDGE

Late Amazonian Strike Gives Inter Milan 1-0 Win Over Atletico Madrid

MILAN, Italy (AP) — Inter Milan's late strike from the Amazonian rain forest gave them a 1-0 victory over Atletico Madrid in the Italian league. The late goal was scored by a player who is known for his ability to score in the rain.

Match Times

Team	Score	Minutes
Inter Milan	1	84
Atletico Madrid	0	

Match Times

Team	Score	Minutes
Inter Milan	1	84
Atletico Madrid	0	

## DORTMUND ANGRY OVER EINHOVEN PENALTY AWARD

Dortmund are angry over a penalty award to Eintracht Frankfurt in a recent match. The club's manager expressed his frustration with the decision.



Portrait of a man, likely a football player or manager.

It is certainly one of the most important goals of the season. I think we deserved this. Now we have another goal. We know how good they are but I think we can do it again."



## HAALAND TO CITY'S RESCUE

Manchester City's Erling Haaland is expected to be a key player in the team's success this season. The club's manager has high hopes for him.



Portrait of Erling Haaland.

## BATERN TO PART WAYS WITH TUCHEL

Bayern Munich coach Thomas Tuchel is expected to leave the club at the end of the season. The club's board has decided to part ways with him.

Bayern Munich coach Thomas Tuchel is expected to leave the club at the end of the season. The club's board has decided to part ways with him.



Portrait of Thomas Tuchel.

Bayern Munich coach Thomas Tuchel is expected to leave the club at the end of the season. The club's board has decided to part ways with him.

Bayern Munich coach Thomas Tuchel is expected to leave the club at the end of the season. The club's board has decided to part ways with him.

Bayern Munich coach Thomas Tuchel is expected to leave the club at the end of the season. The club's board has decided to part ways with him.

Bayern Munich coach Thomas Tuchel is expected to leave the club at the end of the season. The club's board has decided to part ways with him.

Bayern Munich coach Thomas Tuchel is expected to leave the club at the end of the season. The club's board has decided to part ways with him.

Bayern Munich coach Thomas Tuchel is expected to leave the club at the end of the season. The club's board has decided to part ways with him.

Bayern Munich coach Thomas Tuchel is expected to leave the club at the end of the season. The club's board has decided to part ways with him.

...ensuring his nation's  
...baptism, Indian athletes se

...suppage-time  
**Arsenal**

# STUNNER

eno  
with  
slow-  
ly to  
ions  
r the

into  
rto a

f the  
s The

a vic-  
Lon-

ike it  
f Eu-

ition.  
adlock

it into  
minutes

strike  
ame in

be the  
se time



I think the credit for that goal goes to the whole team, for what they did in the 90 minutes. We played well, we defended well, we left all our energy on the pitch. Regarding the goal, when the opportunity arose, I didn't hesitate. I am very happy. We will try to replicate in London what we achieved here. We will try to stay solid and give our best, as we always do.

—Wenderson Galeno, who scored Porto's winner

GALENO'S  
LATE STRIKE  
WAS PORTO'S  
300TH GOAL  
SCORED IN THE CL  
(GROUP STAGE  
TO FINAL)

DEPLETED LIVERPOOL  
...AWAY LUTON

...in

ward,  
in the  
he man



## **The Persecuted Self**

### ***Psychoanalytic Reflections drawing on Kohut***

**Divvy Bajpai**

Delhi School of Business, VIPS-TC

#### **Abstract.**

The objective of this paper is to interpret Kohut's theory of the development of the self in India, with a focus on narcissistic disturbances, their sources, and their causes. Building on Kohut's theory about the role of relationships and social milieu in shaping the personality, we can see some familiarity with the collectivist culture of India, namely the cohesive self – all bringing about self-esteem as well as esteem for the family and community. The ideals and values found in the mature individual may not be individualistic in nature but are based on the collectivistic we-self. On the other hand, Kohut's autonomous self does not enable an Indian to challenge family and community cohesion.

**Keywords.** *Kohut, Psychoanalysis, Indian Family, Narcissistic Disturbance, Rage, Shame*

#### **Introduction.**

Kohut's theory of the self was popular due to its cultural sensitivity and its resonance with the times in late twentieth-century Europe. He differed from many principles of Freudian psychoanalysis but included both the theory of drives and object relations in his attempt to build a meta-psychological theory.

Children in India have multiple caregivers – relatives, elders in the family, siblings, unmarried siblings of parents, and even neighbors. Interdependence is the norm in families and communities. To preserve this interdependence, it is important to retain cohesiveness as the fabric of society. There is a vast literature on changes in the structure of the Indian family, the upbringing of children in nuclear families, and greater mobility of family members. Children go off to a different city or country to study, and adults relocate for work. Indian culture emphasizes duties and responsibilities to the family to sustain and nurture its collectivist nature.

#### **Personal History.**

I grew up in remote parts of India where my father was employed. We lived in gated communities, side by side with different families. In this world, different festivals were celebrated, kids from all families had a large playground, there was a good school and colleges in science or arts nearby. My parents were open-minded toward different regional cuisines and loved developing knowledge of food, as well as regional languages. I had four siblings out of which three are sisters and one brother. My father had traditional ideas such as sending us to a regular Montessori school where regional language was the primary means of instruction, while

my mother was ambitious and sent us to English medium schools and universities. We were given good care and love by our parents and siblings.

As far as I can remember, my disturbances started at a young age. The first rupture in my sense of safety was the realization that some of my relatives were pedophiles and sexual predators. Girls and adult women were not safe around them. These relatives lived in different parts of the country, so we were unsafe only when visiting them. My mother questioned them and told them to keep away from children. My father pretended ignorance and avoided confrontation with anyone. From a Kohutian perspective, this indicated a defective ideal. We joked in the family that our strict routine and discipline-oriented mother was the man in the family, and the nurturing, empathic, kind father was the mother. I decided much later as a mature adult that our father was stern too and supported us to develop our ambitions and pursue career and professional goals. But he was flawed in that he would want us to take up any job where we could be hired irrespective of the qualification and experience required. Often, this meant that he suggested taking up the smallest jobs which were easy to get. This also meant that we were not under pressure to be toppers in class and to do anything outstanding, except things that would help us maintain our normal, regular, middle-class life. On the other hand, my mother had great expectations and ambitions for those of her children who were good in their studies, although both parents were kind to the children who were average in their studies. Everyone adored my brother as the male child, as is the culture in India.

I exposed myself to the dangers of the world outside when I insisted on moving to a hostel and enrolling in an English medium school at the age of 14, and left the town where I grew up. My family moved to a different city in the region because my father followed his mentor to a new and better opportunity. My older sisters had already joined colleges in different cities to pursue university education. There were overnight buses from the city where my parents lived to my city. I was a timid and introverted person at that time. These overnight bus rides were not always safe, with occasional groping of strangers. The other option was to travel by the morning bus and find my way to the hostel at night. If I traveled overnight, I had one more day to spend at home.

The quality of hostel life in the new city did not suit me and I started falling sick with frequent bouts of malaria. After one episode of prolonged fever for over six weeks, I developed low blood pressure, and low sugar and had a severe mal seizure at night. My roommates called my sisters in this medical emergency and I was taken in the morning to a public hospital. I was diagnosed with epilepsy but never had seizures again. However, the disease carried a big stigma and fear for me and my parents. I had to take medicines for the next seven years till I finally reduced the dosage on my own. I started going alone for regular medical checks. Our parents had raised us to be independent and manage our matters, so I could manage this medical journey.

Later on, I recounted the fear and anxiety I felt as I saw persons with various neurological illnesses and other diseases when I waited to see my doctor. My class teacher at school was a kind lady who encouraged me, as did the principal who was a stern figure but always treated me gently. They suggested to my father that I should be taken home to study at a local school and live with them since I was unwell. But I insisted on prodding till the Board exams. In retrospect, I think that I should not have moved out of my home. I was young, and immature and had expected my sisters to take care of me and understand my needs, the way my parents did. But they had their life to live, away from the supervision of our parents reminding them of the duties of older siblings. So, they forgot my existence and rather made me feel unwelcome at times. As adults, we discussed these memories and our hurt feelings. We promised to help each other as siblings, forgave each other, and continue to look out for each other even today. This failure of self-object empathy and its reparation strengthened our relationships and also ourselves, and we felt strong and not abandoned by each other.

The cultural differences between regions came as a shock to me. Boys and girls did not talk in class, look at each other, exchange notes, or interact much outside the class. I also struggled with health issues. I developed multiple allergies and stomach problems. As an adolescent, I started feeling like a big misfit in my school. They insisted that I tie rakhi to any boy in the school to celebrate the festival but I refused because it was only my brother to whom I would tie rakhi and post rakhis to my male cousins. The festival celebrates the protection given by a brother to his sister, who prays for his long and healthy life. I did not see myself in need of such protection, and pretend for a day that someone I did not know was my brother. My class teacher remained furious with me throughout the rest of my academic year. I felt estranged from my classmates. The problem worsened when I learned that some guy in my class had been nominated to make me his girlfriend. I told my only friend in the class that I was concentrating on my Board exams and did not want a boyfriend. Many classmates treated me as someone rebellious, proud, stubborn, arrogant, and unfriendly. To this day, that female friend and I remain close. From a popular and happy girl in class who was liked by her teachers for being sincere and respectful, I was shattered to become an unpopular classmate as a result of cultural differences.

Earlier, we had experienced only the loss of our roots, homeland, relatives, and mother tongue and my parents had lost the community feeling of living close to their biological family, relatives, and friends. My parents kept in touch with them through the occasional telegrams, long-distance phone calls that would disconnect every three minutes, and a trip back home every two years, which turned into a five or ten-yearly trip as my mother was diagnosed with muscular dystrophy. My parents encouraged us to write letters to our grandparents and cousins. I took great interest in writing letters to them, unlike my twin sisters who were happy-go-lucky. Psychoanalytically, I had directed my narcissistic libido towards some of these cousins to whom I wrote regularly about our changing lives and treated them as my ideals because some of them studied at top universities in India. These relationships ended in great disappointment later in

life as they did not reciprocate my affections and I felt rejected and abandoned by these narcissistically cathected self-objects. Kohut talks about narcissistic disturbances resulting from the failure of both truly cathected self-objects and narcissistically cathected self-objects.

From a regular student to a regular absentee in class, I had fallen behind in my studies and felt incompetent and at a loss about my future. I decided against getting married at that stage and pursued my second postgraduate studies in Clinical Psychology, in which I had a BA. My parents became concerned about my prospects in life as far as career and marriage go because as my father often said, I may end up becoming mentally ill if I spent so much time doing weekly internships at hospitals for the mentally ill. I looked at some of the teachers and doctors I admired from these fields and told myself and my parents that if they could remain sane, I would not become mentally ill either. However, I became a source of worry and disappointment as my promising grades in school did not result in a degree in technology or medicine but in the field of mental health. Caught in these tensions and complexes, I experienced a persecuted self.

My father had retired early and my mother's neurological illness had advanced. She developed continuous weakness in her limbs. Her two unmarried daughters and an unmarried son made her depressed. My parents eagerly phoned relatives and learned of everyone's progress, realizing that others had built their social and financial status while we focused on survival. Marriage proposals could not come our way since suitors and their families in an arranged marriage system would want to visit the family, see the prospective bride or groom, the condition of their house, and the depth of their wealth, besides educational qualifications. Female doctors or engineers were preferred.

We migrated and settled in a different city after my father's last job. I pursued studies for an MA degree, to understand the psychopathology and physical illnesses that I had seen in my family. I also found a suitor through friends. He was not nice to me at times but it took me a long time to realize it. This person told my parents that they should be grateful that his parents were magnanimous enough to proceed with our alliance despite the medical history of our family. He also confided privately that he did not intend to let me pursue higher studies after marriage. His parents had already modified my name. I know it is done so that the woman is separated from the identity she has developed since birth and makes her compatible with the husband's family, like a tabula rasa. My parents and my oldest sister convinced me to end this alliance and build my career because that is what I wanted. They supported me unconditionally. Some of my relatives sabotaged my marriage prospects by spreading lies that I was already married since they had daughters of marriageable age and they could pursue these alliances. I was awarded a PhD from a top management college in India, worked on disability policy in my doctoral research, got married, and have a child.

## **Psychoanalytic Reflections.**

Indian culture encourages the development of the creative self. Caught in these tensions and complexes, I experienced a persecuted self. It also argues that the ideals and values found in the mature self are collective in nature. Unlike the autonomous, nuclear self that Kohut defined as healthy, the self that I developed is healthy because I exercised autonomy in personal and professional relationships. Within the family, I remained strongly embedded in relationships with my family, my extended family members, and my community. This defining characteristic of the cohesive self is accepted in India. The father's self-object provided ideals and goals for idealization and included intimacy, empathy, sharing, and other dimensions of a good relationship. These were internalized for the development of healthy and strongly held ideals and values in myself.

Kohut also calls the self the Tragic Man who struggles to fulfill the ambitions and the ideal of his nuclear self. I, the tragic man, was situated historically, culturally, and socially in an increasingly industrialized society. Kohut said that the goal of self is to develop into a cohesive, autonomous self that strives towards successful creative expression of ambitions, ideals, humor, wisdom, and an acceptance of the inevitability of death. (Kohut, 1980, p. 524-525).

So, what threatened the cohesion that I had experienced? This problem is magnified when family members, especially young adults like us sisters, make decisions regarding marriage outside our community. I as an Indian adult did not receive admiration for my talent and achievements to create a humble self. Narcissistic disturbances can lead to feelings of shame and guilt if there is a failure in the achievement of one's abilities, according to Kohut. But I argue that shame and guilt are experienced by Indians not only as by-products of a failure in achievement but also failure toward self-objects.

The experiential features of narcissistic rage, as described by Kohut in the form of shamefaced withdrawal (flight) or narcissistic rage (fight), are experienced at times. The cultural expectation of maintaining close bonds with a multitude of extended family members, conformity and obedience, the importance of honor and respect, and the traditions of my family and community created many actual and anticipated situations for the development of narcissistic vulnerability. As an Indian, I responded to the development of an autonomous self of the narcissistically cathected self-object by developing an independent entity away from familial and social kinship pressures. It is common to find Indian adults who try to get a job, start a business, or build a profession in a town or city close to their hometown or birthplace or where their biological family lives. They also respond with greater rage or shame when there is unresponsiveness from idealized figures, and suffer from a sense of guilt much more easily than a Western individual for failing the self-objects in family.

## **In Conclusion.**

The self that develops in Indian society is quite different from Kohut's self. It pursues goals and ambitions which are not based just on talent. The self tries to develop abilities that can strengthen the social, familial, and individual standing in the community. Ambitions and goals are directed in this direction and a distinction is made between goals as being materialistic or dharmic (religious), not just in the sense of rituals but in the sense of self as described by religious philosophy. Thus, many Indians can be fatalistic because they do not have a sense of urgency to achieve creative expression of all their nuclear talent. It is not uncommon if I leave the pursuit of my current ambitions for another lifetime, and am likely to be respected for this sacrifice in the service of the family (object relations).

Narcissistic damage that we see among Indians arises from the cultural and social conditions of our culture. They do not reflect all the conditions that Kohut describes as sources of narcissistic personality disturbances. Kohut's theory is cross-cultural. The Indian self develops a greater need for praise during the phase of development in childhood. The cohesion of the self through periods of transition is facilitated by the presence of primary self-objects, and by extended family members who also act as self-objects. The development of the autonomous self is a greater threat for females in a patriarchal, collectivist, multi-generational, multiple-caregiving society because of inadequate development of the grandiose-exhibitionistic self, and insufficient encouragement, and support for the achievement of talent and ambition, with excessive emphasis on a merger with religion to maintain the purity, sanctity of womanhood. Practices such as changing not just the last name or family name but a woman's first name after marriage in some Indian communities contribute to this loss of identity and cohesion of the self.

Indian culture encourages the idealization of parents and authority figures even when there is disillusionment with them. Surrender and conformity to the expectations of others are encouraged and approved. It is acceptable to maintain the cohesion of the family even if these others are abusive, controlling, or harmful. Thus, a cohesive, autonomous self does not develop easily. Self-esteem regulation depends on relationships with significant others for the self in India and not on abilities and achievements alone. So, the Indian self currently is not autonomous. The goals of a cohesive self in India include a greater commitment to the family and community and contributing to their development, welfare, and well-being even if this responsibility needs to be fulfilled at the cost of injuries to the physical, emotional, and psychological well-being. Thus, it is very different from the goals Kohut had in mind for his autonomous, cohesive, nuclear self for whom relationships remained secondary to ambitions and achievements through the use of talent and ideals.

As we adopt Western lifestyles – the conditions of a nuclear family, a fast-paced lifestyle, and isolation from the network of extended family support – it is precipitating the kinds of narcissistic damage that Kohut talks about. We can see in an urbanized India the development of a

defective self, suffering from the symptoms described by Kohut. This self suffers from a sense of emptiness and depression, narcissistic disturbances, which stimulate itself just to feel alive.

Books and Papers Accessed.

1. Greenberg, J R and Mitchell, S A. (1983). Object relations in psychoanalytic theory. Harvard University Press. 351-372.
2. Kohut, H. (1972). Thoughts on narcissism and narcissistic rage. The Psychoanalytic Study of the Child, Vol. 27. Yale University Press. P. 360-399.
3. Kohut, H. (1984). How does analysis cure? Ed. Goldberg, A and Stephansky, P Eds. The University of Chicago Press, 110-153.
4. Kohut, H. (1979). The Two Analyses of Mr Z. International Journal of Psychoanalysis, 60, 3.
5. Kohut, H. (1978). The Search for the Self. Vol. 1, 2, 3, 4. International Universities Press, Inc.
6. Kohut, H. (1985). Self-psychology and the Humanities. Ed. Charles B Strozier. W W Norton & Company, New York & London.
7. Akhtar, S and Kramer, S. (1998). Eds. The Colors of Childhood. Northvale, NJ: Jason Aronson.
8. Akhtar, S. (1999). Inner Torment: Living between conflict and fragmentation. Northvale, NJ: Jason Aronson.
9. Roland, A. (1988). In Search of Self in India and Japan. Princeton University Press.
10. Sharma, D, Nagpal, A, Derne', A, Roopnarine, J L, Suppal, P, Kakar, S (2003). Childhood, Family and Sociocultural Change in India. Ed. Sharma, D. Oxford University Press.
11. Curtis, R. (1991). The Relational Self. New York: Guilford Press. Pg. 138-277.

**The author may be contacted at [divvyabajpai@gmail.com](mailto:divvyabajpai@gmail.com).**



# Reflections on the Psychotherapeutic Use of Hypnosis in Persecutory Anxiety

Ruchika Gupta

## Abstract.

The current paper is yet another reflective voyage into persecution. It also provides reflections from psychoanalytic literature on self-conflict, investigating the defense mechanisms in this altered state of consciousness.

**Key Words.** *Hypnosis, Psychoanalysis, Defense Mechanisms, Consciousness, Unconscious*

## The Case

Sarita (F), a 34-year-old homemaker, had been experiencing chronic delusions for two years. She was admitted to the hospital with serious health issues and underlying symptoms of a mental health disorder. Her husband, a school teacher, had been diligently taking care of the home, and supporting Sarita throughout this challenging journey.

Sarita exhibited para-psychotic symptoms, seeing multiple God figures that induced fear, reminded her of her past life, and provided warnings about her surroundings and the future. Her husband described instances where Sarita behaved dramatically with hair-tossing, head shaking, yelling, and aggressive hand gestures, resembling a goddess with divine powers.

After going through various home-grown solutions, including seeking help from tantric, priests, prayer services, and temples, and giving donations, the couple realized that medical examination and consultation were their last options.

Sarita's illness left her mentally and physically fatigued, experiencing tension, headaches, body aches, fever, difficulty in eating, and sleeping, and even challenges with basic bodily functions. In consultation with a psychiatrist, the couple was introduced to hypnotherapy and therapeutic suggestions. Sarita was eventually enrolled in Progressive Muscle Relaxation (PMR) techniques, a form of self-progressive muscle relaxation.

PMR involves systematically tensing and releasing different muscle groups to induce a state of relaxation. Under the guidance of a psychiatrist, Sarita practiced PMR regularly during therapy sessions, utilizing breathing and focusing techniques alongside occasional biofeedback administration. Throughout the sessions, the medical and counseling staff explored the connection between Sarita's thoughts and physical tension, identifying specific stressors in her life. Through PMR, Sarita developed the ability to respond to stressors with a relatively relaxed and composed state of mind. Over time, with the therapy along with her medications, her body ache diminished, and her overall sense of well-being improved.



Sarita's experience not only restored her family's trust in medical practitioners but also heightened their awareness, reducing their previously conflicting attitudes towards the stereotypical notions around mental health. The practice of hypnosis, with its various forms such as behavioral hypnotherapy, cognitive hypnotherapy, clinical hypnotherapy, and regression hypnotherapy, provided a versatile approach tailored to her needs. Notably, the structured self-hypnosis approach allowed Sarita to focus, motivate herself, enhance self-awareness, and harness innate skills.

In summary, Sarita's journey highlights the potential of hypnotherapy, particularly PMR techniques, as a means to manage stress, enhance self-awareness, and promote overall well-being. The experience served as a gateway to greater emotional resilience and strengthened the understanding of the mind-body connection in the context of mental health.

### **Psychoanalytic Reflections.**

The case is a multifaceted exploration into the intricate realm of hypnosis, unraveling fundamental principles and, in particular, helping discern defense mechanisms activated during self-conflict. The domains of self-conflict, self-control, and self-interest serve as pivotal focal points. Self-conflict is the internal discord arising from a misalignment between inner desires and outward actions, emerging as a critical phenomenon for psychic tensions. This conflict often materializes due to lapses in self-control, the cognitive ability to consciously override impulsive behavior in pursuit of long-term goals, and the dynamics of compliance with own needs and desires – a facet underscored by its unconscious nature.

In evidence studies on the biological whereabouts of the unconscious, the case is about the intricate interplay between mental states and behavior beyond the realm of conscious awareness. Sarita traverses a terrain of anxiety stemming from unacceptable thoughts and feelings. Coping and defense mechanisms disentangle as distinct but interconnected facets of the psychological apparatus, embodying active defenses to stressors.

In the context of stress and trauma, reflections turn their gaze towards Post-Traumatic Stress Disorder (PTSD), and accentuate the instrumental role of hypnosis in accessing traumatic memories as a constituent element of PTSD treatment. The guiding principles of hypnosis in this therapeutic realm involve the deliberate induction of regulated access to traumatic memories, assistance in managing heightened emotional responses, and the facilitation of the restructuring of memories and their significance.

Psychotherapy positions hypnosis as a transformative means of self-assessment and personal growth. Hypnotherapy, depicted as a dynamic and effective modality, emerges as a catalyst in dismantling defense mechanisms, providing a secure space for introspection, and paving the way for enduring positive changes. The therapeutic process, rooted in accessing the unconscious mind, becomes a transformative journey of self-discovery, healing, and personal

empowerment – an interdisciplinary tapestry weaving together psychological, biological, and therapeutic threads to unravel the complex interplay of consciousness, unconscious processes, and the pursuit of psychological well-being.

Cognitions, emotions, and intentions can impact behavior and thinking beyond conscious awareness, and volitional control is termed the psychological unconscious. Although Freud is often credited with the discovery of the unconscious, interest in unconscious mental states dates back to 18th. century philosophers such as Leibnitz, who emphasized perceiving subliminal stimuli, and Helmholtz in the 19th. century, who posited that unconscious influences regarding environmental stimuli contribute to conscious perception.

In contemporary discussions, the distinction between automatic and controlled mental processes is frequently associated with unconscious processing. Automated procedures commence without conscious intention, operate in the background, and persist until completion. In a literal sense, automatic processes are unconscious since they are known only through inference and are never directly accessible to conscious awareness. Experimental research involving brain-damaged patients provides evidence for unconscious memory.

Throughout debates on the mind-body connection hypothesis, we have biological evidence for the presence and distinctions between the conscious and unconscious. An increasing body of research suggests that computationally conscious and unconscious processes share similarities, and functions related to subliminal information processing, problem-solving, motivation, decision-making mechanisms, working memory, etc. do occur and operate unconsciously (Hassin et al., 2009; Hassin, 2013).

Van Gaal et al. (2008) state that unconscious stimuli can influence task performance or interruption, exerting a form of cognitive control. Despite the historical attribution of the prefrontal cortex to the neural correlates of consciousness, recent neuroscience research indicates subconscious activation of the prefrontal cortex, challenging its fundamental role in consciousness (van Gaal & Lamme, 2012).

Individuals consistently endeavor to present their best selves while mitigating anxiety in response to potential threats to the ego's integrity. To achieve this, various defense mechanisms are employed. Throughout their lives, individuals may encounter circumstances leading to negative emotions and diminished self-perceptions. Theories explaining how people respond to such situations encompass conscious and unconscious mental processes, along with emotional regulation systems. Psychological defenses and coping strategies empower individuals to navigate unfavorable conditions. Coping and defense mechanisms may represent distinct facets of the same psychological process, with coping involving active approaches and defenses entailing passive responses. Notably, while defense mechanisms operate automatically, coping can be either controlled or automatic, depending on the type of defense mechanism employed.

Anna Freud's seminal work, "The Ego and the Mechanisms of Defense," published over 75 years ago, remains a cornerstone for understanding emotional balance. Defense mechanisms (DMs) are vital psychological strategies unconsciously employed to cope with anxiety arising from unacceptable thoughts and feelings, as outlined by Freud in 1959. Cramer (1998) outlines six defining characteristics of DMs, including their operation beyond awareness, safeguarding self-esteem, shielding from excessive anxiety, contributing to normal personality functioning, potential pathology with excessive use, and distinguishability from one another. In Anna Freud emphasizes the ego's unconscious defensive operations in the treatment process. Freud identified the ego as a complex structure emerging from the perceptual apparatus, mediating among the id, superego, and external reality. Hartmann adds that individuals are born with innate psychic structures, and the ego's development of object relations is co-determined. Mental equilibrium is promoted by an ego that mediates inner and outer imperatives.

Unacceptable childhood wishes persist as unconscious fantasies seeking resolution through compromise formation, shaping interests, character traits, behavior, and neurotic symptoms.

## **References & Notes.**

1. Melman, R B and Lichtenberg P (2001). Freud's Relevance to Hypnosis: A Reevaluation. The American Society of Clinical Hypnosis.

Hypnosis had a significant impact on the inception of psychoanalysis as a result of Sigmund Freud's insight alongside the viewpoints of physician and neuroscientist Jean-Martin Charcot at the Salpêtrière Hospital in Paris. Sigmund Freud's key contributions to the area of hypnosis included the importance of direct suggestion and regressive hypnosis. He insisted, however, that direct post-hypnotic suggestion could often be insufficient in causing long-term change in patients, and that regressive hypnosis played an important role in finding a long-term solution to a pattern of problems by reaching out to the source of the individual's challenges in his or her subconscious. Originally, he devised psychoanalysis based on his experiences with hypnosis and treating grand hysterics, which are now classed as dissociative disorders. He developed a new understanding of the human mind and distress, abandoning the concept of dissociation and a passive pathology model associated with reduced psychic cohesion. Instead, he proposed an active defensive process known as repression, and concluded that psychological discomfort was caused by intrapsychic conflict. Freud's rejection of hypnosis led to a divide between hypnosis research and psychoanalysis.

2. Gennaro, R J (1999). Leibniz on Consciousness and Self-Consciousness. New Essays on The Rationalists.

Leibnitz was a pioneering figure to the concept of "Petites Perception". He insists of existence of clear consciousness in every creature, i.e. from a man to an organism of the lowest state of existence. He emphasizes in his work that each organism is a mirror of the cosmos, and the

higher form contains each distinct till higher constituents of that of its lower being, allowing for varying degrees of clarity in a person's mental life. The major contribution of Leibnitz can be traced towards recognition of existence of "unconscious" and "subconscious" in the field of Psychology. In his work, The terms "obscure ideas", "obscure representations", "perception without perception or consciousness", "insensible perceptions" and other similar terms are used to describe the unconscious mental processes. This terminology later did turn inaccurate and potentially contradictory in many aspects. Nonetheless, the appraisal of several findings made on his end in the field of psychology inevitably contributed to subsequent psychologist's interpretation of his perspective, which they then utilized to build the thesis of "unconscious ideas".

3. Bernfeld, S (1944). Freud's Earliest Theories and the School of Helmholtz. The Psychoanalytic Quarterly.

The renowned physiologist and physicist of the 19th century, Helmholtz, made significant advances to the science of psychology. According to Helmholtz (1866), perception could only continue on the basis of some sort of underlying inference using past expectations or knowledge from experience due to the inherent ambiguity of the information received by sense receptors. In other words, perception is a process that leads to a hypothesis about what, in light of past experiences or expectations, is most likely to be the cause of the current stimulation (Gregory, 1997).

4. Hassin, R, Bargh, J, Engell, A and McCulloch, K (2009). Implicit working memory. Consciousness and Cognition.

The publication by Hassan et. al. argues that by putting forth mechanisms that enable non-conscious, automated processes to quickly adjust, the participation of WM and executive functions in these processes may aid in the resolution of what we called the adaptiveness paradox. The paper further works on the idea of unconscious controlled processes where it mentions that particularly in higher-order cognitive processes including problem solving, decision making, reasoning, and goal pursuit, working memory is crucial to regulated activities. Since working memory is traditionally associated with conscious awareness, it should not be surprising that existing models of high order non-conscious processes do not involve working memory. Nonetheless, the results of this study imply that implicit working memory and implicit executive functions can be included in such models. This action might pave the way for fresh avenues of investigation into high-order cognitive processes that are automatic and unconscious.

5. Hassin, R R (2013). Yes, It Can: On the Functional Abilities of the Human Unconscious. Perspectives on Psychological Science, 8, Pg. 195–207.

The paper asserts that a mindset that has broad ramifications for thinking and reasoning in

domains outside of the conflict itself coexists with nonconscious goal conflicts. It specifically suggests that unconscious goal conflicts cause a way of processing information that makes it more likely to tackle a problem from different angles. This article draws attention to what might be a worthwhile distinction to investigate between the influence of unconscious goal conflicts on decisions connected to conflicts and those unrelated to conflicts.

6. Gaal, S, Ridderinkhof, K, Fahrenfort, J, Scholte, H and Lamme, V. (2008). Frontal Cortex Mediates Unconsciously Triggered Inhibitory Control. *The Journal of Neuroscience*.

The range and complexity of the brain's processing of unconscious information have long been believed to be restricted. The PFC's high-level cognitive control processes appear to be the most likely to need conscious experience out of all cognitive functions. The paper state that unconscious stimuli can influence task performance or interruption, exerting a form of cognitive control. Despite the historical attribution of the prefrontal cortex to the neural correlates of consciousness, recent neuroscience research indicates subconscious activation of the prefrontal cortex, challenging its fundamental role in consciousness (van Gaal & Lamme, 2012).

7. Fahrenfort, J, Snijders, T, Heinen, K, van Gaal, S, Scholte, H and Lamme, V. (2012). Neuronal integration in the visual cortex elevates face category tuning to conscious face perception. *PNAS*.

The paper sought to evaluate how the neural activation of areas in the brain as a result of conscious and subconscious working. The idea discussed is that unconscious activity can stimulate the prefrontal cortex, wherein several top-down processes and factors like attention type; temporal/ spatial, and probed task set, determine the scope, breadth, and directions of certain stimulations and activation. Despite being unconscious, these prefrontal responses are operational in the sense that they are connected with behavioral outcomes related to cognitive control, such as response inhibition, task switching, conflict monitoring, and error detection. In addition, recent research suggests that the state of consciousness, for instance in patients in a state of somnolence or during sleep and anesthesia, is closely related to the scope and extent of residual recurrent connections among brain regions. It appears that specific brain areas (or cognitive modules) may support specific cognitive functions, but that consciousness is independent of this. Conscious sensations arise only when the brain areas involved engage in recurrent interactions enabling the long-lasting exchange of information between brain regions.

8. Elhnan, C, Grand, S, Silvan, M and Ellman, S J (1998). *The Modern Freudians Contemporary Psychoanalytical Technique*, USA.

Sigmund Freud initially theorized ego defense mechanisms (Dms), with subsequent elaboration by Anna Freud. In the 1920s, she was among the earliest young analysts in the field. She shortly joined Freud's Inner Circle, wrote numerous influential articles and books, served as

an adult training analyst and supervisor, and was widely regarded amongst the architects of International Psychoanalysis from the time of Freud's death in 1939 until her own death in 1982. Cramer (2000) posits that these unconscious processes assist the ego in managing internal and external stressors that induce anxiety.

Anna Freud's seminal work, "The Ego and the Mechanisms of Defense," published over 75 years ago, remains a cornerstone for understanding emotional balance, as noted by Bowins in 2004. She thought that interpretive analysis should stick to its more productive focus of examining inner disputes in people who are otherwise less typical. Individuals who experienced early trauma in their relationships and had developmental flaws need a modified type of analytic therapy that emphasises defense reconstitution, structure building, and ego support. Anna Freud stated firmly in her 1976 article on modifications to psychoanalytic practice: our comprehension of these serious problems from a psychoanalytic perspective has far surpassed our ability to treat them with analytic treatment. The child's ego can repair the damage it has caused to itself during development through analysis; however, damage caused by early deprivation or trauma to the ego cannot be repaired and must instead be healed using a modified version of the "ego-building" technique.

9. Cramer, P (1998). Coping and Defense Mechanisms: What's the Difference? *Journal of Personality*.

Cramer (1998) outlines six defining characteristics of DMs including their operation beyond awareness, safeguarding self-esteem, shielding from excessive anxiety, contributing to normal personality functioning, potential pathology with excessive use, and distinguishability from one another. Cramer (2000) posits that these unconscious processes assist the ego in managing internal and external stressors that induce anxiety. In her article from 2015, Cramer has tried to encompass the functioning, scope, and range of the Defence Mechanisms on how they additionally unravel their effect for different categories of events, situations, and people in a variety of ways. Beginning from the historical relevance, Cramer traces how defense mechanisms can take pathological turns; The traits of pathological defenses include extensiveness, rigidity, and overgeneralization (applied to several individuals or circumstances). Additionally, they are incorrect, out of step with the person's developmental stage, or unsuitable for the current circumstance (see Lichtenberg & Slap, 1972; Loewenstein, 1967). They also frequently skew perceptions of reality and obstruct other ego processes. In certain situations, defense mechanisms may exacerbate pathology. Further, the author has discussed in a wide, manner on how defense mechanisms function through stages of normal development, with a focus on affective factors like age, gender, and sex.

10. Hartmann, H (1959). The Development of the Ego Concept in Freud's Work. In M. Levitt (Ed.), Readings in psychoanalytic psychology, Pg. 84–105. Appleton-Century-Crofts.

Hartmann gives a synopsis of the evolution of the idea of the ego. Hartmann attempts to respond to multiple queries: Which set of ideas guided Freud's approach to his work? What has replaced them, and when and why were they changed? What role did thinking and experience play in the ego's development from a physiological model of a collection of neurons with a continuous cathexis to a sophisticated system capable of self-harmonization and synthesis? The author posits that individuals are born with innate psychic structures, and the ego's development of object relations is co-determined

**The author may be contacted at [ruchikag13@gmail.com](mailto:ruchikag13@gmail.com).**



## Intersubjective Reflections

### *from Literature*

Those of you, who are reading this story, you too may wish to add your own lines and join in. But, for this it would be necessary to mutilate and shorten some English words that have served us well, words that have been the cause of our misery, as well as our success. Sensitivity, for instance. A word that has been the cause of our international success, may be modified thus:

Sensiti sensiti  
Sensiti vity vity  
Born to a minda  
Sensiti vity vity

With this as the refrain, I went on adding lines as they came to my mind. These are the lines I can remember now:

Seena's sensiti  
Said's sensiti  
Born to a minda  
Sensiti vity vity

(or in Srinivasa's case)  
Born to Ford  
Sensiti sensiti  
Sensiti vity vity

Harvard sensiti  
Fostered by the white shetty  
Vedic sensiti  
Nurtured by the dark bhatta  
Seena's sensiti  
Said's sensiti  
Born to a minda  
Sensiti vity vity

(The following should be sung as a melody)  
i-can-be-neither-here-nor-there sensiti  
Seena's sensiti  
Said's sensiti  
Born to Ford  
Sensiti vity vity  
India's glory, great sensiti  
Arab glory, grand sensiti  
Born to a minda, very VERY sensiti  
Prostituted-itself-to-bastards sensiti  
Padded-the-white-man's-ass sensiti  
Seena's sensiti  
Said's sensiti

Sensiti sensiti  
Sentiti vity vity  
Born to a minda  
Sensiti vity vity  
To slander the brahmins  
Export folklore  
To flatter the brahmins  
Export vac-lore  
Yajna-ritual Tanta-ritual Funeral-ritual  
Wedding-ritual

(Hereafter in the Harikatha Style)

The minda themselves setting it up, themselves heading it, editing it themselves, and later the minda themselves inviting the Indian monks through offering them scholarships, and training them in their tapobhoomi such as Chicago, Harvard and Princeton, sending them back with PH.D.s, inviting them again and again.

Our Srinivasa Joisa suddenly remembers the smell of the cowshed from his past life and is all upset

(The following is a dance song)

Agonizing, teaching, seminar-hopping  
project on Gandhi  
Budget from a minda  
To slander these minda  
Funding from Ford  
Lo! A book is born!  
Seena's book  
Said's book  
A Kannada book  
Born to the minda

(Now melodiously)

I-can-neither-be-here-nor-there book  
What sort of book?  
I-am-that book  
Who-am-I book  
Hari Hari book  
Hara Hara book  
A chaste book  
Though born to the minda  
O, sensiti sensiti  
Sensiti vity vity

Out of the bastard  
Loafer's Bofors' guns  
Out of the Nobel Foundations  
Ah, a book!  
O, the book  
A book born to the minda

At a climactic moment I stopped beating on the ghatam, stood up and, like a prophet, declared:  
If there is a Ford, only then can you afford to say  
Both hands raised, making quotation marks with my fingers, I started singing again with  
Srinivasa also joining in:  
Ayyo ... I can neither be here  
Nor go back there

We hugged each other and laughed, and laughing, I looked up and liked the picture of Akkayya Srinivasa had painted. And I said to Srinivasa, both of us in the topis made from areca fronds, in our trousers and jackets and our middle-age gravity, dancing like clowns—dear readers, please note that I could say the following to my friend only in English—‘You see, precisely because your painting and talking of Akkayya is awkward and absurd, it also feels authentic.’

Just then, out of habit, I felt my hip-pocket and found my wallet gone! Till early morning, we were in front of the heater, laughing and joking.

***from Akkayya, Pg. 202-206, in Stallion of the Sun and Other Stories (1999), by U R Anantha Murthy. Edited and Translated from Kannada by Narayan Hegde. Penguin Books.***

Prof Hegde writes this in the Introduction to the collection of short stories:

This phase of Anantha Murthy’s writings is marked by a range of attitudes – from an increasing unwillingness to espouse any absolutist position in the conflict between tradition and modernity to a downright distrust of rationalist attitude often in the form of celebration of simple faith. In the process of comprehending the seemingly simpleminded nature of Venkata in the ‘Stallion of the Sun’ and the extraordinary innocence of Akkayya, both the autobiographical narrator of the former story and the protagonist of the latter subject their own rational attitude to rigorous scrutiny. In both stories ...there is a wistful longing on the part of the protagonist for his lost innocence.

Open in app ↗



Search



Member-only story

LANGUAGE

# When White People Try to Hide Their Racism, They Use These Phrases

To avoid the scarlet letter "R," they're adopting this strategy



Allison Wiltz · Follow

Published in Writers and Editors of Color Magazine

8 min read · Dec 27, 2023



AI-generated photo of a Black and White woman speaking | photo created by author using CANVA

In American society, many White people live in fear of being called a "racist." It's become a scarlet letter for some because once you're exposed as such, you may lose legitimacy in your professional life and the community more broadly. For instance, last fall, a police officer in San Jose, California, Mark McNamara,

commented in a text thread that he "hates Black people." In Antioch, California, an investigation showed at least 40% were involved in a similar text thread. Officer Rombough confessed to "only stopping" people because "they are black." While another officer referred to their new Black police chief as a "gorilla." Many officers lost their jobs, and their statements became part of the public record. This is the type of humiliation and consequence most hope to avoid. However, refraining from using explicitly racist language doesn't mean someone doesn't harbor racist beliefs, just that they've learned it's best to ingrain plausible deniability in the language they use.

In a viral video, Danny Collins, a white general contractor from Florida, gave a nearly comprehensive list of phrases White people use when they're "low-key racist." These phrases may sound eerily familiar, and of course, this isn't an exhaustive index. Still, it's helpful to discuss the subtle ways racism finds its way into everyday conversations, often from people who claim they're anything but racist.

### **"All Lives Matter."**

Without further ado, let's get started with a common one, "all lives matter." Of course, White people began saying "all lives matter" and "blue lives matter" in response to the Black Lives Matter movement, a way to silence those using the slogan. If we lived in a society where all lives matter, we wouldn't need to use the aspirational phrase, Black Lives Matter. Nevertheless, given that police officers continue to kill Black people at nearly three times the rate as White people, it's safe to say the slogan is still necessary. Honestly, how can all lives matter if black lives don't? It's become painfully evident in the past few years that "All Lives Matter" is one of those phrases that sounds benign, but it isn't when you understand the context in which this phrase gained popularity. What they wanted to say was, "Black Lives Don't Matter," but that would be blatantly racist, and if your goal is to conceal intent, then you have to walk this line of pretending you are arguing in good faith.

### **"I don't see color."**

If Black people had a dollar for every time a White person claimed, "I don't see color," we would have closed the racial wealth gap by now. That's how common this phrase is. When someone claims they do not see race-defining characteristics like skin color or facial features, their statement *contradicts* everything we know about how the human brain functions. In a 2012 study, Hagiwara, Kashy, and Cesario found that "both skin tone and facial features independently affected how negatively, as opposed to positively, whites felt toward Blacks using both implicit and

explicit measures." So, while many White people claim they don't see race, suggesting that somehow they are above the fray, research shows that's not true. White people do see race, but by refusing to acknowledge racial identity impacts our experiences, they maintain the status quo, all the while playing innocent.

*The persistence of racial disparities in education, health, wealth, poverty, and incarceration supports the notion that we live in racially hierarchical society, which affords unearned benefits to White Americans and unfairly burdens people of color. The very existence of these disparities challenges claims that race does not matter in U.S. society — Neville et al. (2016)*

Danny Collins suggested that White people often claim not to see color when, indeed, they do. The declaration, "It doesn't matter if you're black, red, yellow, green, or purple," doesn't stand under scrutiny. We can't imagine our way out of a racist society. Simply claiming not to see color avoids the work of actually creating a culture where Black people are treated equally and provided equitable opportunities. That's like claiming to benefit from a book you never read or feeling the benefits of a morning jog without ever stepping a foot outdoors. It's simply an illogical premise but a very commonly held belief. Colorblindness is racist because it ignores the experiences of Black people and people of color. And while it may sound benign, it's a cancerous idea, one that's spread far and wide in American society.

### **"My best friend is Black."**

When confronted with the accusation that they said or did something racist, White people often respond defensively by saying, "My best friend is black," or as Collins said, "I have three Black friends." First of all, it needs to be noted that if you are a White person who is actually friends with a Black person, then you wouldn't use their racial identity as a shield for accountability. Secondly, it's unlikely this person has any idea they're being referred to as someone's "black friend." This phenomenon makes you think twice about letting a White person snap a picture of you at a social gathering. Who knows when they may whip out your image in the heat of an argument with another Black person, point at you, and say, "See. This is my Black friend," without any consideration for how that person may feel being used in that way.

Having a Black friend, neighbor, colleague, spouse, or lover doesn't inoculate someone from harboring racist beliefs. You can have children with a Black person

and still have unblackness to unpack. Just ask Thomas Jefferson, our third president, about his relationship with Sally Hemings, a 14-year-old girl he enslaved and commenced having children with when he was 44 years old. Despite spending her life having his kids and trying to appease him, Jefferson never freed Sally. Proximity to blackness didn't turn Jefferson into an abolitionist, nor did he advocate for the advancement of Black people's rights. Jefferson believed that Black people "are inferior to the Whites in the endowments both of body and mind." In the modern era, we should consider the validity of the claim, "I have Black friends," because research conducted by the Public Religion Research Institute suggests that three-quarters of White people do not have any non-white friends. While many claim to have a Black friend, most don't. Furthermore, if you had a Black friend you respected, you wouldn't go out of your way to undermine their experience.

### **"You're so well-spoken, articulate."**

As a kind of underhanded compliment, White people often tell Black people they are "well-spoken" or "articulate," which begs the question, "Why do you think that an intelligent Black person is an anomaly?" Whether they are doing so knowingly or not, White people use this phrase when they are impressed by a Black person expressing their intellectual dynamism. However, in doing so, they expose themselves as the type of person who doubts the intellectual capacity of Black people. Calling a Black person "articulate" is a way of expressing shock and almost disbelief at their intelligence, which is incredibly racist.

The problem Black Americans face is not an inability to express intellect but the factors that inhibit them from that expression. For instance, from 1740 to 1867, anti-literacy laws prohibited enslaved Black people and, at times, freed Black people from reading and writing. Jefferson, for example, claimed Black people were "in reason much inferior" to White people, all the while ignoring the role chattel slavery played in prohibiting access to educational resources. In essence, many White people believed they were superior because they expressed intellect through reading and writing while conveniently forgetting that their access to education made this possible. Systematically depriving Black people of access to reading, writing, and communicating with their Indigenous tribes in West Africa created a literacy gap. Still, racists claim there is an underlying biological difference.

While there's nothing racist about acknowledging that a Black person is intelligent, there is something paternalistic about calling them "articulate" and "well-spoken" because the White person is positioning themselves, in the conversation, as



someone who is an authority on what intelligence is. They also rated their intellect on their ability to interact using the English language, a way of rewarding them for assimilating. Their shock then becomes an underhanded compliment designed to obfuscate their racist ideas about Black people and their potential as human beings. The story of John Berry Meachum, a Black man who started a floating freedom school to bypass anti-literacy laws in Missouri, comes to mind. When confronted with racist laws, Meachum found a way to ensure Black people had access to educational opportunities.

Of course, Danny Collins provided more examples, such as White people claiming "it's not the system, it's the culture" that keeps Black Americans living as second-class citizens. And, of course, Black people have heard the all too popular phrase, "America can't be racist. We had Barack Obama as president." And the constant accusations about us having a "victim mindset" seem to be stuck on repeat. When it comes to police brutality, White people often suggest that "he should have complied" in a way that removes sympathy for a Black person's death. This is similar to the way men ask what a woman is wearing after learning she's been sexually assaulted, an effort to justify rape. And let's not forget about the dangerous "black on black crime" myth or the constant pearl-clutching over crime in "Chicago." Or the all too popular white liberal talking point that "it's not racism" but "classism," a statement that ignores the all too obvious truth that both are social problems. And you can't solve classism with race-neutral policies because you would, in essence, maintain the racism within the status quo.

Of course, all of these talking points or phrases are designed to deny the role racism plays in Black people's lives to avoid getting a scarlet letter "R" stitched onto their public persona. The reason Collins' video likely went viral is because so many people can relate to hearing these phrases throughout their lives, over and over again, from White people who claim they couldn't possibly be racist. "I don't have a racist bone in my body. Who me? Couldn't be," they argue, but methinks they doth protest too much. While some White people attempt to mask their ill intent behind colorblind slogans, Collins' video shows they are not as convincing as they once were.

**References**

Hagiwara, N., Kashy, D., & Cesario, J. (2012, February 10). The independent effects of skin tone and facial features on Whites' affective reactions to Blacks. Retrieved December 02, 2020, from

<https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/abs/pii/S0022103112000133>

Neville, H. A., Gallardo, M. E., & Sue, D. W. (2016). *The myth of racial color blindness: Manifestations, dynamics, and impact*. American Psychological Association.

## **ABOUT the CONTRIBUTORS**

1. Divvyaj Bajpai is a teacher and researcher in the fields of public policy, psychology, organizational behavior, and human resource management. She is a Fellow (PhD) of IIM Calcutta and an emerging psychoanalyst trying to bridge Western perspectives with critical applications in India.
2. Gracy Jebastina is a psychoanalytic psychotherapist. She is an Associate of Sukrut and is the Director of the residential Inward Change Conference (ICC), now in its 21st year. She is also the promoter of Unleash Schools PLC in Bangalore and works with adolescents and teachers.
3. Ruchika Gupta is a Forensic Expert with the Chandigarh Police. She is an academician and practitioner of Forensic Psychology, with experience in the developmental and education sectors.
4. Shreeranjini GN teaches English at Parikrma Humanity Foundation, a K12 English-medium school for underserved children in Bangalore. She is an Associate of Sukrut, a psychoanalytic psychotherapist, and an art therapist.
5. Manab Bose is the Founder-Publisher of Citta. Trained in India and overseas, he has several years of experience in psychoanalysis and psychotherapy. He also teaches at IIM Udaipur.
6. Varalakshmi GN is a psychoanalytic psychotherapist with Unleash Schools PLC. She is an Associate of Sukrut.
7. Aishi Sengupta, Akash Singh, Anupam Das, Goldwins Paul, Gracy Jebastina, Maria Leena, Merlyn Rao, Ruma Chatterjee, Shanthi VK, Varalakshmi GN, and Manab Bose participated in the Retreat. All are Associates of Sukrut and completed the internships in psychoanalytic psychotherapy with Sukrut's Inward Change Conference (ICC).



*SUKRUT announces its*  
**Inward Change Conference (ICC) 2024**  
**Summer Event - 04 to 09 May 2024**  
at Quiet Corner, Masinagudi, TN.

Sukrut is an institution committed to the promotion of knowledge and practice in psychoanalysis. Incorporated in 2006 to address challenges in mental health, she began to offer internship in psychoanalysis, supported with intersubjective studies and seminars. The training draws on relational psychoanalysis which emphasizes the real-time presentation of internal dynamics within the psychoanalytic relationship, and distinguishes itself by emphasizing the effect of real interpersonal relationships on development. Sukrut psychotherapists privilege authenticity. They liberally self-disclose. They loathe separating transference out from the actual professional relationship. They conceive transference and countertransference as features of all relationships.

Professionals trained in Sukrut comfortably connect with the inner world of feelings so as to identify the toxicity that builds in the self. In both personal and group relations, as well as in consulting with education, social entrepreneurship, government, and industry, Sukrut helps leaders identify the psychodynamics of systems that inhibit growth and development.

## THE INTERSHIPS

Internships with Sukrut are informed by relational psychoanalysis and contemporary intersubjective, self-psychology thereby creating a containing, holding, protective environment, attuned to the needs of interns and providing them with high levels of close, careful listening and attention. They embrace Winnicott's oft-quoted phrase that it is a joy to be hidden, but a disaster not to be found.

ICC has morphed into immersions across three phases, offered annually in Winter and Summer.

Phase 1 offers exploration into the world of feelings as central to decision-making. This stand-alone entry phase seeks to help individuals become aware of, make sense of, regulate, accept, express, and transform emotional experiences. It is based on an evolutionary understanding of feelings as an innate and adaptive system which helped us survive and thrive. Our feelings give us important information about the world, and about our wellbeing and the toxicity within; they inform us of our needs and guide our actions to meet them.

This phase is an exploration into the self. Acquiring new perspectives, in an atmosphere of sharing without being judged, opens new insights into a world of being (the internal world) and of becoming (the external world). The immersion also helps explore and arrive at new meaning-making and choice-making for the actual decisions that we take.

One can find meaning for the self by attending only Phase 1. One can also plan to go further into Phase 2, which invites deeper explorations into the self and its interface with systems. Participation beyond Phase 1 necessitates a process of discussion with a senior professional in Sukrut.

If selected to attend Phase 2, Sukrut recommends commitment of a three to five-year period for professional study, application, and practice in areas that could range from offering individual therapy to group work to consulting and teaching leadership and organization psychodynamics.

**Phase 1 of ICC 24 Summer will be held from Sat: 04 May 24 to Thurs: 09 May 24, residentially**

### Who can attend?

You must be a Graduate in any subject, a budding Psychologist, a Post-Graduate in Rehabilitation and Social Sciences with a few years work experience, passionate to explore the world of feelings and decisions, as well as to bring change in people's lives.

### How will I benefit by making this commitment?

The immersion will help clear cobwebs in the mind, and lead to authoritative presence.

### Many interns planned their commitment like this:

- Completed Phase 1 in May, and attended Phase 2 after six months in December.
- On completion of Phase 2 in December, advised to attend Phase 3 the following May, thereby completing the 03-phase internship in a year.
- On completion of Phase 3 and Parts 1 and 2 of the Intersubjective Study, you will be required to attend the final Part 3, which is mostly a series of seminars on applications from psychoanalysis.

Sukrut will provide, upon request, a Certificate to all who successfully complete three phases of the internship and the Intersubjective Studies and Seminars. On completion of Phase 3, it is likely that you will be invited to join Sukrut events for facilitation.

### Phase 2 and Phase 3 of ICC 24 Summer Event are also from

Sat: 04 May 24 to Thurs: 09 May 24. The Winter event is normally offered in December.

### Administrative Information

The venue is Quiet Corner India, Mavanshella, Masinagudi Post, Nilgiri Dist., Tamil Nadu 643 223, India. Contact details are: +91 423 2526316 / 2526161 / 2526350 and [www.quietcorner.org](http://www.quietcorner.org)

These are fully residential programmes and all interns will be required to stay at the venue. Interns will be provided accommodation on a sharing basis. The sessions will be conducted at floor-level, on mattresses; participants are advised to carry loose-fit clothing for ease of sitting.

Interns must arrange personal travel so as to reach the venue on Sat: 04 May 24, in time for lunch. Interns can plan to leave after lunch on Thurs: 09 May 24.

The programme Fee per participant is Rs 15,000.00 on room-sharing basis, inclusive of early-morning tea, breakfast, lunch, an evening snack, and dinner.

Limited bursaries are available to self-sponsored participants who will need to make a request in writing to the Conference Director. Details about remittance of the Fee will be advised to participants who register.

If you are curious to learn more about ICC, please contact any of the following:

Aishi Sengupta, in Chennai at +91 87908780657 / [aishisengupta@hotmail.com](mailto:aishisengupta@hotmail.com)  
Anupam Das, in Mumbai at +91 99209 93140 / [anupamdas@hpcd.in](mailto:anupamdas@hpcd.in)  
Gracy Jebastina, in Bengaluru at +91 98448 78236 / [jebastina@gmail.com](mailto:jebastina@gmail.com)  
Lalita Jalan, in Kolkata at +91 62910 05744 / [lalita\\_jalan@yahoo.com](mailto:lalita_jalan@yahoo.com)  
Manab Bose, in Bengaluru at +91 98809 32293 / [manabbose1@gmail.com](mailto:manabbose1@gmail.com) / [manab.bose@vsnl.ac.in](mailto:manab.bose@vsnl.ac.in)  
Merlyn Rao, in Bengaluru at +91 9986795109 / [merlyns@perikmafoundation.org](mailto:merlyns@perikmafoundation.org)  
Pallab Bandyopadhyay, in Bengaluru at +91 9148157039 / [hrlpluspallab@gmail.com](mailto:hrlpluspallab@gmail.com)  
Ruma Chatterjee, in Kolkata at +91 98311 68398 / [ruma1@rocketmail.com](mailto:ruma1@rocketmail.com)  
Rajashree Choudhury, in USA at +1 310 880 0886 and +91 90732 39545 / [rajashree7@aol.com](mailto:rajashree7@aol.com)

### The Facilitators

The decision to invite Facilitators is a consultative process between the Conference Director of ICC 23 Summer Event and other key individuals in Sukrut. The internships are conducted by psychotherapists empathic to the experiences of their clients.





## SUKRUT announces a SHORT EVENT ROLE AUTHORITY IDENTITY FROM 04 TO 07 MAY 2024

at Quiet Corner, Masinagudi, TN.

Sukrut is an institution committed to the promotion of knowledge and practice in personal well-being through applications from psychology. The programme addresses the internal dynamics in individuals and distinguishes itself by emphasizing the effect of real interpersonal relationships on personal growth. Sukrut facilitators privilege authenticity. They liberally self-disclose and comfortably join the struggles of participants in the programme.

### ROLE AUTHORITY IDENTITY

This 03-day event will be informed by Rogerian self-psychology, thereby creating a containing, holding, protective environment, attuned to the needs of individuals unable to commit a longer engagement. They embrace Winnicott's oft-quoted phrase that it is a joy to be hidden, but a disaster not to be found.

The event offers exploration into the world of feelings as central to decision-making, and seeks to help individuals become aware of, make sense of, regulate, accept, express, and transform emotional experiences. Our feelings give us important information about the roles we take up, and our ability to exercise authority. Our identity shapes our needs and guides our actions to meet them.

#### Who can attend?

You must be a Graduate in any subject, with a few years work experience, passionate to explore the world of feelings and decisions.

#### How will I benefit?

The immersion will help clear cobwebs in the mind, and lead to authoritative presence. Sukrut will provide, upon request, a **Certificate of Attendance**.

#### Administrative Information

The venue is Quiet Corner India, Mavanahalla, Masinagudi Post, Nilgiri Dist., Tamil Nadu 643 223, India.  
Contact details are:  
+91 423 2526316 / 2526161 / 2526350 and [www.quietcorner.org](http://www.quietcorner.org)

These are fully residential programmes and all participants will be required to stay at the venue, in accommodation on a sharing basis. The sessions will be conducted at floor-level, on mattresses; participants are advised to carry loose-fit clothing for ease of sitting.

**Participants must arrange personal travel so as to reach the venue on Sat: 04 May 24, in time for lunch, and can plan to leave after lunch on Tue: 07 May 24.**

- The programme Fee per participant is Rs 5000.00 on room-sharing basis, inclusive of early-morning tea, breakfast, lunch, an evening snack, and dinner.
- Limited bursaries are available to self-sponsored participants who will need to make a request in writing to the Conference Director.
- Details about the remittance of the Fee will be advised to participants who register.

**If you are curious to learn more about Sukrut events, please contact any of the following:**

Aishi Sengupta, in Chennai at +91 87908780657 / [aishisengupta@hotmail.com](mailto:aishisengupta@hotmail.com)  
Anupam Das, in Mumbai at +91 99209 93140 / [anupamdas@hplcl.in](mailto:anupamdas@hplcl.in)  
Gracy Jebastina, in Bengaluru at +91 98448 78236 / [jebastina@gmail.com](mailto:jebastina@gmail.com)  
Lalita Jalan, in Kolkata at +91 62939 05744 / [lalita\\_jalan@yahoo.com](mailto:lalita_jalan@yahoo.com)  
Merlyn Rao, in Bengaluru at +91 9986795109 / [merlyn@parikramafoundation.org](mailto:merlyn@parikramafoundation.org)  
Pallab Bandyopadhyay, in Bengaluru at +91 914857039 / [hrpluspallab@gmail.com](mailto:hrpluspallab@gmail.com)  
Ruma Chatterjee, in Kolkata at +91 98311 68398 / [ruma@rocketmail.com](mailto:ruma@rocketmail.com)  
Rajashree Choudhury, in USA at +1 310 880 0886 and +91 90732 39545 / [rajashree7@aol.com](mailto:rajashree7@aol.com)

# INTERSUBJECTIVE STUDY & SEMINARS 2024.3



## FOCUS AREAS

### PART 1

Psychology and Key  
Psychoanalytic  
Theories

### PART 2

The Self in Philosophy,  
Comparative Religion,  
Geo-politics, Geo-economics,  
Psycho-history

### PART 3

Psychoanalytic  
Reflections

### & BEYOND PART 3

Advanced Psychoanalytic & Psychodynamic Reflections

## WHEN:

**ALL SESSIONS ARE ONLINE**

**PART 1 - Fridays**

**PART 2 - Saturdays**

**PART 3 - Sundays**

## A. THE CONTEXT AND OBJECTIVES

Psychoanalytic Psychotherapy is a practice that demands knowledge about the human condition in increasingly complex social contexts. The study of interrelated subjects assists in the diagnosis and makes it meaningful. Unfortunately, the training of psychotherapists remains confined to the traditional curriculum, with little linkage with the rapidly changing dynamics of society. Sukrut has been sensitive to the growing need to curate intersubjective perspectives in the larger relational system in which social phenomena crystallize, and in which experience is continually and mutually shaped. Language is becoming one of interacting subjectivities, reciprocal mutual influence, colliding organizing principles, conjunctions, disjunctions, attunements, and mal-attunements – a vocabulary attempting to capture the endlessly shifting, intersubjective context of intra-personal and intra-social experiences.

Sukrut Human and Organization Consultants Pvt Ltd  
152, 14th Main, Block 4, Koramangala, Bangalore 560034, India | Landline: 080-40955662 | [www.sukrutindia.in](http://www.sukrutindia.in)



## INTERSUBJECTIVE STUDY & SEMINARS 2024.3

The need, therefore, is for an intersubjective approach that helps us diagnose current beliefs and actions that continue to stem from our civilizational ethos, rooted in our philosophy, our religion, and our political and economic systems – not as products of isolated mechanisms – but as forming at the interface of reciprocally interacting worlds of experience. The constantly changing complexity in which we live today cannot be understood apart from the inter-subjective contexts in which they take form (Stolorow, R. and Atwood, G. 1992. Contexts of Being: The Inter-subjective Foundations of Psychological Life. Hillsdale, NJ: The Analytic Press).

The objectives of these interphase studies, (mandatory for interns undergoing the final two phases of internship) are to create a reflective space for intellectual and professional development to:

1. Develop insights and perspectives for diagnosis of mental health,
2. Enable space for reflections from the practice of psychoanalytic psychotherapy,
3. Enable psychodynamic diagnosis of business and organization, in teaching and consulting.

### B. THE CURRICULUM

Registered participants will receive a timetable of the Part for which she/he has enrolled. They will also receive a set of reading materials, either after or before the session.

### C. THE FEES

Rs 5000 (USD 65 / Euro 65 / GBP 50) per participant for all sessions. Bursaries are available. **Please write to [varalakshmi.gn@gmail.com](mailto:varalakshmi.gn@gmail.com) to enroll.**

### THE SUKRUT WAY

Sukrut is an institution committed to the promotion of knowledge and practice in psychoanalysis. Incorporated in 2008 to address challenges in mental health, she began to offer an internship in psychoanalysis, supported by intersubjective study and seminars. The training draws on relational psychoanalysis which emphasizes the real-time presentation of internal dynamics within the psychoanalytic relationship, and distinguishes itself by emphasizing the effect of interpersonal relationships on development. Sukrut psychotherapists privilege authenticity. They liberally self-disclose. They loathe separating transference from the actual professional relationship. They conceive transference and countertransference as features of all relationships. Professionals trained in Sukrut comfortably connect with the inner world of feelings to identify the toxicity that builds in the self. In both personal and group relations, as well as in consulting with education, social entrepreneurship, government, and industry, Sukrut helps leaders identify the psychodynamics of systems that inhibit growth and development

## PRAYER for a BETTER WORLD

***A mother made a run to Walmart with her young son. While in the store, she turned around and he was gone. She looked all over for him, and was on the verge of becoming frantic when she walked to the front of the store and spotted him.***

She was just getting ready to lay some scolding on him when she realized he was doing something very strange. He was kneeling at one of the benches just inside the store and he was praying. She could not understand why he was doing this. Then she looked above him at the huge poster he was facing. It had photos and descriptions of missing children, and it read: "Every second counts." So she took a photo of her son doing this and posted it on Facebook. It went viral in no time. And as it did, one Facebook commenter summed it up pretty well, writing: "Whether or not you believe in God really doesn't matter. This was a child in Walmart who was thinking about others and doing the only thing he could to help. The world would be a better place if everyone followed his example."



Printed by: KUSUMA ENTERPRISES  
#82/2, Hanumanthnagar, Bangalore - 19 | M : +91 9342 490 439 | kusumaenterprise@gmail.com

This volume of **CITTA** has been printed and published by Manab Bose  
ISBN Number : 978-81-964771-0-3